



HARVEY G. AGER, M.D., P.L.L.C. / PSYCHIATRY

29355 NORTHWESTERN HIGHWAY, SUITE 140
SOUTHFIELD, MICHIGAN 48034
(248) 356-8050 FAX (248) 356-8054

BOARD DIPLOMATE, AMERICAN BOARD OF PSYCHIATRY & NEUROLOGY

January 27, 2012

Mr. Jeffrey R. Clark
Mr. Patrick R. Sturdy
Cummings McClorey Davis & Acho, P.L.C.
33900 Schoolcraft Road
Livonia, MI 48150

Re: Zihra Saad
City of Dearborn Heights
Claim No: 100741
Our File No: A-1211216B

Dear Mr. Clark,

In response to your request, I have examined Ms. Zihra Saad at my office in Southfield today, 1/27/12, in reference to a lawsuit with the Dearborn Heights Police Department.

The following report contains the results of my evaluation, and includes both a detailed history and a formal mental status examination. The examination itself lasted approximately one hour.

Prior to my evaluation today, the only documents I reviewed were the Notice for the IME, and the Stipulated Order for Physical Examination and Other Discovery.

BRIEF OVERVIEW

Ms. Saad is an eighty year old Arabic American female, who is married and has six adult children. She was driven to my office this afternoon by her son, Samer, although she does drive herself on occasion. She lives in Dearborn Heights with her husband, who suffers from Alzheimer's disease.

Ms. Saad was aware that the reason she was in my office today was because of her pending litigation with the Dearborn Heights Police Department.

HISTORY OF THE INCIDENT

According to Ms. Saad, the incident occurred on 7/10/10, a date she states she will "never forget." According to my calendar, 7/10/10 was a Saturday. She states it was dusk, at approximately 8:30 PM, when a Dearborn Heights Police officer came to her home, and her oldest son, Joseph, answered the door. I had evaluated her son, Joseph, this morning, and I assumed that his mother, Zihra, knew why the police officer had come to their home, but when I mentioned to her the situation with the girl, Krystal, whom he had been dating and her grandmother across the street, and the fact that her son, Joe, had left a voicemail for the grandmother with what was interpreted to be a threatening message, she told me that she had no idea why the police had come to the door; Joseph had never told her that, and she said, "He kept that from me".

At any rate, she states when she heard the pounding on the door, she was still in bed, so she did not have her head scarf on, and she was not wearing slippers or shoes, and was still in her pajamas. Her husband was seated in his wheelchair in a nook. She came out to see what was going on, and was shocked when eventually several police officers arrived, along with she said was a police dog; but she may have confused this incident with one that occurred several months before; at least based on what her son Joe told me this morning. At any rate, she states her husband was upset and fell out of his wheelchair and was on the ground. She kept yelling at the officers to leave her son, Joe, alone. At one point, they tasered him, and he was laying on the ground, and she claims that they started pounding his head on the floor.

She states a large female police officer arrived on the scene, and was the one who she claims manhandled her and dragged her across the front lawn. In the process, she states she bumped her right knee on a tree. She was not wearing her scarf. She states she was handcuffed and thrown into the back of the police car, and taken to the police station.

She states they fingerprinted her, but she started gasping for air, and they realized she was having a medical problem, and called an ambulance. She explained she had open heart surgery performed back in 1995, and was under the care of a cardiologist, Dr. Samer Salaki. She was taken to Oakwood Hospital where it was determined she would need a cardiac stent operation.

She states when she was discharged home, she was not able to sleep very well, and her doctor gave her some Xanax to take at night to help her sleep, but it was not helping, so she was switched to Ambien. She states she was having dreams about the incident, and she still occasionally has them, but not nearly as often. She states she already had problems with her knees and she has been suffering with arthritis for years, which affects her not only in her knees, but her hands and other parts of her body.

She states she now has "new knees;" she just recently had her right knee surgery performed on 4/14/11, by way of an implant. She had the left knee done before that, and it is fairly well healed, but she states she is having problems with the right knee, because it is hot and swollen. At one point today she pulled up her pant legs to show me both of her knees. Following her last surgery, her doctor told her not to drive for a period of time, but she started driving before the time was up. She is self-described as always having been a very determined, forceful person. She states had she been somewhat younger, she could have fought off that large female police officer; I believe her.

She states she was surprised that they would have done this to her because she is a very prominent figure in the Arab community. She is a member of the Women's Arab League and attends meetings regularly and is also a member of the local Muslim church.

Re: Ms. Zihra Saad

January 27, 2012

Page 4

She states when she went to court, she had a lot of her followers from the Arab community with her, and they were all offering to do anything they could for her. Her case was dismissed, but her son, Joe's, case went to trial, and eventually the charges were dismissed on him as well.

When I asked her if she had ever seen a psychiatrist, she appeared almost offended, indicating no, that there would be no reason she would do that. She then remembered that after the last incident, the one in July of 2010, some Hindu woman came out to her house perhaps five or six times, but she did not like talking with her, so she told her not to come back anymore. She does not believe that she is in need of psychiatric treatment now.

Several months prior to the incident in July of 2010, she states her son had apparently gone through a stop sign near their home, and a different Dearborn Heights police officer had followed him home, and had pulled a gun on him. They came into her house, and he still had his gun drawn and she was shocked, because at one point, he pointed it at her chest. She pleaded with him to put the gun away. Her son was subsequently arrested and eventually worked out a plea deal arrangement.

For a while there, following the second incident, she made sure all of her windows and doors were locked. She states just yesterday her husband apparently was hallucinating and shouting, and imagined he saw the dog that was in the house again.

She states there was quite a bit of publicity about the situation, and there were articles in the Dearborn Herald and the Detroit News. Channel 4 and Channel 7 also wanted to interview her and her son.

She states she is taking Plavix for her heart, and she takes Motrin and Mobic for arthritis, and still uses Ambien when necessary at night.

She vows that if she were to die before the litigation is settled, she will have it in her will that she wants her great grandson to still pursue the case.

PAST MEDICAL HISTORY

She has had a total of seven pregnancies, including one miscarriage. She had no problems going through the menopause.

In addition to her bilateral knee replacements, she had her gall bladder removed. She had open heart surgery in 1995, and one or more stents implanted in July of 2010.

She states sometimes she has problems with her memory, insofar as remembering certain names, but in general appears to have a relatively good memory for a woman eighty years of age. Her family doctor is Dr. Alexander Raybova, and he is the one who prescribes the Xanax and Ambien for her.

The surgeon who performed her knee implants is Dr. Solomon. She states her knees basically "wore out" over the years. She has received Cortisone injections in her knees in the past, but said she didn't want to continue having them because of potential adverse side effects, including thinning of her bones.

She is diabetic. Dr. Raybova treats her for her diabetes. She takes Glucophage and Amaryl.

PERSONAL HISTORY

She was born in Dearborn, but her parents were from Lebanon. She was raised Muslim, and she still attends mosque on a regular basis and observes and celebrates all of the holidays.

When her parents first came to this country, they settled in Indiana, and her father worked for the railroad. They then moved to Dearborn, which is where she was born on 11/13/31. Her father got a job with the Ford Motor Company, but when she was five years old, they decided to move back to Lebanon. When she was eleven years old, her father died from causes unknown to her. When she was sixteen years old, she got married in Lebanon, and moved with her husband to Dearborn Heights, and they have been living there ever since.

Re: Ms. Zihra Saad
January 27, 2012
Page 6

The last time she went back to Lebanon to visit was in 2005, but her doctors were not happy with her because of her husband's Alzheimer's disease, but she states she did not really know about it then. Apparently some of her in laws were still living there at the time.

She dropped out of school when she was sixteen after she married and left Lebanon. She is now the sole survivor in her family; all of her siblings, her parents, and all other relatives in this country are deceased. She had three brothers, and while she was living in Beirut, Lebanon, her brother Johnny who was four years older than her, died from malaria. She would have been seven at the time. She states she cannot really remember Johnny's death.

She has two younger half siblings; Nemer who went by the Americanized name Charlie, and who died from cancer of the bladder in July of 1984. A year later, her other half brother, Mohammed, whose Americanized name was Mike, died, in January of 1985. Both of her parents had been married previously. Mohammed was a product of her father's previous marriage, and he died from old age. Charlie was by her mother's first marriage.

She had one sister, and her name was Alice. She was seven years older than her, and she died four years ago from lung cancer. She was living in Dearborn at the time.

She states even all of her in laws are deceased. Thus, she and her husband are both sole survivors. She states fortunately she has a lot of grandchildren, great grandchildren, nieces and nephews.

She and her husband had owned a series of markets; they had the Better Supermarket, and she opened Sarah's (Zihra's) Supermarket in Taylor, and they had stores in Detroit as well. She states she got a lot of help in her market from the Standard Beef people. She states he knees eventually wore out. She started her business in 1967, and sold it in 1977. She is on Social Security now.

Her husband was diagnosed with Alzheimer's in 2005, and it has been progressive since then. She denies that she ever told her son, Joe, that she

was planning on putting her husband into a nursing home; she states she would never do that. Joe did move back in with them in 1998 and lived with them up until the incident of July of 2010.

She states she gets help from her children and other family members in caring for her husband. Her son, Jamal, lives nearby with his family, and he even moved his business into their basement.

Her son, Joseph, is her oldest, and he is sixty three. Samirah is the second oldest, and her daughter works for the courts and recently was in Boston. She apparently works as a translator. The third oldest is her daughter, Mary, who is a big shot at Henry Ford, she has a doctorate; she states she practically runs the place. Her son, Samer, is her fourth child, and he works with his brother as an appraiser. Jamal is the second youngest, and he is also an appraiser, and the youngest is Faten, she is forty seven years old, and is a high school teacher.

She was aware of the fact that Joe was dating the young girl who lived across the street with her grandmother, and she states she never approved of that relationship. She believes her son, Joe, is somewhat of a gambler, although he was lucky a few weeks ago, when he and he and his cousin won \$450,000 before taxes; but she states he has probably lost as much over the years gambling. The cousin, she explained, is her husband's brother's son.

She states she attends meetings at the Women's Arab League once a month, and goes to mosque every Friday. She celebrates the holidays twice a year, and they prepare large dinners. She does much of her own housework, but sometimes her family helps out, or else she has a cleaning lady come in. Her husband requires twenty four hour care. She states he would do the same thing for her if the situation was reversed. She always ran the household, and her husband took care of the business.

CURRENT DAILY ACTIVITIES

She denies being depressed or suicidal. She states she occasionally may have dreams about the incident. She reads her Koran and her bible and attends mosque on a regular basis. She attends meetings and is active in the

Arab community. She is not experiencing any financial problems. She states her husband was a great man before he developed the Alzheimer's, and she would never abandon him.

MENTAL STATUS EXAMINATION

Ms. Saad presents as a well developed, well nourished, eighty year old female, who was neatly dressed and well groomed. She was wearing a scarf around her head and glasses.

She states she forgot her cane, and was walking in a somewhat unsteady limping manner. She was complaining about pain in her right knee and at one point pulled up both pant legs to show me her surgical scars.

She came across as a very determined, self-assured woman. She was certainly not timid.

She was fairly cooperative and was pleasant and was engaging. She appeared to enjoy the attention I afforded her. Initially, however, she appeared somewhat offended when I informed her I was a psychiatrist, she did not understand why she needed to be here, or talk about her personal life or background with me.

She did not appear clinically anxious. She told me that she does not like talking about what happened in July of 2010, and now that she has discussed it with me, she will probably be sick today. At times, she appeared angry when describing what happened with the police.

She did not appear clinically depressed. She was never tearful. She was not suicidal, withdrawn or agitated.

She had some difficulty with her memory, including long term memory functions, such as remembering proper names, but for the most part, for a woman of eighty her memory was relatively intact.

She was not hallucinating or delusional. Her stream of consciousness was logical, linear and goal directed in nature.

Her insight was fair. She was a rather unsophisticated woman.

Her IQ was within normal standards, and was consistent with her limited educational background and her social background. She spoke and understood English well.

Her sensorium was clear, and she was alert and oriented to time, place and person.

Her judgment appeared intact, both on an operational and formal basis.

Her intellectual functions were well preserved, and there were no signs of concretization or regression.

SUMMARY AND OPINION

Ms. Saad presents as an eighty year old Arabic American woman, whose personal, psychiatric, medical and occupational histories have been described in some detail during the body of this report.

Based on what she experienced and witnessed back in July of 2010 it would not be surprising if perhaps Ms. Saad developed what is known as a transitory Acute stress disorder. At the present time, I can find no evidence that she is suffering from a chronic Posttraumatic stress disorder, however, and she does not appear clinically anxious or depressed.

She is not interested in psychiatric treatment or counseling of any type. The only psychotropic medications she has taken in recent years has been an occasional Xanax, or Ambien at bedtime.

Ms. Saad is a woman of advanced age, and she has a husband she has to care for who suffers from severe Alzheimer's, and she has health problems herself, including chronic arthritis, diabetes, and heart disease. Her memory appears a bit reduced.

Re: Ms. Zihra Saad
January 27, 2012
Page 10

I do not believe at the present time that she is suffering from a diagnosable psychiatric disorder which would be attributable to the incident or incidents that she and her son, Joe, experienced with the Dearborn Heights Police Department.

I would see no reason to recommend psychiatric treatment for Ms. Saad, and she is clearly not interested in such.

I hope the preceding report will prove to be of some use to you in this matter. If there is any way I may be of further assistance please don't hesitate to contact me.

Respectfully yours,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Harvey G. Ager". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Harvey" being the most prominent.

Harvey G. Ager, M.D.
Board Diplomate,
American Board of
Psychiatry and Neurology

HGA/nra

